A Unified Measure of Fed Monetary Policy Shocks

Chunya Bu, John Rogers and Wenbin Wu

Discussion by Benjamin Wong
ABFER 7th Annual Conference, Singapore
May 27, 2019

Department of Econometrics and Business Statistics
Monash University
Summarize Paper

First-Step

\[ \Delta R_{i,t} = \alpha_i + \theta_i \Delta i_{t}^{IV} + \mu_{i,t}, i = 1, 2, \ldots, 30 \]

Second-Step

\[ \Delta R_{i,t} = \alpha_i + e_t \hat{\theta}_i + \nu_{i,t}, i = 1, 2, \ldots, T \]

- \( e_t \) is the monetary policy shock.
- Comparison of \( e_t \) to a variety of extracted monetary policy shock series
- Show that \( e_t \) does not capture private information by the Fed (more on this later)
- Use \( e_t \) in VAR analysis
Identification

\[ \Delta i_t^{IV} = \Delta i_{t,R1} - \Delta i_{t,R2} \]
My Thoughts

- In the vein of research that use event study/high frequency information to obtain exogeneity
- Authors have clearly thought very carefully about identification
What is a Monetary Policy Shock?

\[ i_t = i_t^* + a_\pi [\pi_t - \pi_t^*] + a_y [y_t - y_t^*] + \epsilon_t^{MP} \]

- Represents the “non-systematic” component of monetary policy
- Taken from a very short term interest rate that the central bank can control (i.e. overnight/Federal Funds Rate)
- Consistent with how people think about it New Keyensian DSGE models ala policy reaction function
- Obvious Challenge
  - What is systematic, what is not?
  - Related to what is exogenous and what is endogenous (classic macro problem)
- If policy is well run, the effect of monetary policy shocks should be small.
Problems brought on by Zero Lower Bound Period

\[ i_t = i^*_t + a_\pi [\pi_t - \pi^*_t] + a_y [y_t - y^*_t] + \epsilon_{MP}^t \]

Systematic/Endogenous

- What is “systematic” when \( i_t = 0 \) for a prolonged period?
- What can the central bank really control?
  - Overnight rates can be perfectly controlled using open market operations, but longer term yields becomes more questionable
  - Is forward guidance or the revelation of private information part of the monetary policy shock?
    - Monetary news shock? (i.e. revealing \( \epsilon_{t+h}^{MP} \))
    - Forward guidance as changing the expectations structure, so is not a shock (e.g. Kulish, Morley & Robinson, JME, 2017)
- Shadow short rate “solves” the problems above, but economic agents do not transact/make decisions on the basis of a negative interest rate
Returning to the BRW Shocks

First-Step

\[ \Delta R_{i,t} = \alpha_i + \theta_i \Delta i_{t}^{IV} + \mu_{i,t}, \quad i = 1, 2, \ldots, 30 \]

Second-Step

\[ \Delta R_{i,t} = \alpha_i + e_t \hat{\theta}_i + \nu_{i,t}, \quad i = 1, 2, \ldots, T \]

- Closest paper in thinking about the problem (IMO) is probably Inoue & Rossi (2018)
- \( \Delta i_{t}^{IV} \) is exogenous change in the MP surprise
  - Crucially will depends if \( \Delta i_{t}^{IV} \) is exogenous
  - If \( \Delta i_{t}^{IV} \) is exogenous, the follow up question is whether this variation is a monetary policy shock.
- More philosophical/rhetorical
  - If elements of private information by the central bank, forward guidance or imperfect control of the yield curve enter \( \Delta i_{t}^{IV} \), is this a measure of monetary policy shocks?
  - Tests for private information with Blue-Chip. Great, but do those guys make any meaningful economic decision? Maybe not, but BRW do better than N&S and SS on these metrics.
Asset Prices React Before and Revert Quickly after Surprises

QE 2
Asset Prices React Before and Revert Quickly after Surprises
More Minor Question about the SVAR

Conceptually, if $e_t$ was exogenous and measures a monetary policy shock, we should be able to run

$$X_t = \beta(L)X_{t-1} + \gamma e_t + \nu_t$$

or by local projection

$$X_{t+h} = \beta(L)X_t + \gamma e_t + \nu_{t+h}$$

or by using an interest rate (maybe say a two year rate) in the VAR and using $e_t$ as an external instrument (i.e. 2SLS)

or even

$$X_{j,t} = \gamma(L)e_t + \nu_{j,t}$$

Not sure you need to run $e_t$ in the VAR (since it is exogenous) and do a Cholesky decomposition (since $e_t$ conceptually already identifies the MP shock)
Conclusion

- A very careful and useful exercise
- Enduring Question: What is a monetary policy shock?