Financial Structure and Income Inequality

Michael Brei, Giovanni Ferri, and Leonardo Gambacorta

Discussed by: Pao-Li Chang (SMU and ABFER)

ABFER 7th Annual Conference
May 29, 2019
This paper studies the empirical relationship between financial development and income inequality.

The sample includes 97 economies over the period 1989–2012 (condensed into non-overlapping 5-year averages).

Financial development is further disaggregated into bank credit versus market capitalization (relative to GDP).

The paper identified a beneficial-to-detrimental pattern (where further FD increases income inequality).

The pattern was found to be more pronounced and regular for market-based financing.
Comments

1. Provide more documentations on the use of system GMM estimator:

   ▶ Are FD variables and/or any other RHS variables allowed to be endogenous in estimations? Or are they assumed to be exogenous?

   ▶ What are the choice of the lags in instrumental matrix?
     the default of lag 1 (and earlier) of the instrumenting variable in levels for the differenced equation and lag 0 of the instrumenting variable in differences for the level equation? Or other lag specifications?

   ▶ Are the instrument matrix collapsed (across $t$ for each instrument) or otherwise (with one moment condition for each $t$)?

   ▶ It is good practice to report the instrument count and test the robustness of results with different lag limit specifications.
2. Include time dummies to remove universal time-related shocks from the errors:

▶ The system GMM estimator assumes that the idiosyncratic errors are uncorrelated across $i$ (countries in the current context).

▶ This may not be valid if the income inequality increases/decreases across the board because of a global shock such as skill-biased technology shock, trade shock, financial crisis, correlation in stock markets across countries?
3. Verify the mechanisms?

- Regress top 10 percentile income on bank-based and market-based FD: Are the effects of market-based FD stronger than bank-based FD? Assuming that the richest derive proportionally more of their income from equities/bonds than bank deposits.

- Construct Gini coefficient based on the sample below 90 percentile (and increasingly lower percentiles), to verify whether the market-based financial development index still has a beneficial-to-detrimental effect.

- Similarly, use the income of the lowest quintile, to verify whether the market-based financial development indicator has any effect.

- Regress past income inequality (before 1990) on future financial development (after 1990), to reduce the concern of unobserved long-run common causal factors → falsification tests.
4. Motivate the robustness checks?

- Why is the beneficial-to-detrimental pattern only present for market-based FD in countries of high economic freedom?
  
  high economic freedom $\rightarrow$ more transparent banking system?

- Why is the beneficial-to-detrimental pattern stronger in countries that made more use of macroprudential policies?
  
  use of macroprudential policies is a response to more aggressive rent-seeking financial sectors? endogeneity issue?
5. To differentiate the current paper’s contribution to the literature from works that use similar estimation specifications

- in terms of findings and implications (rather than in terms of sample size or the set of controls)?
- Seven and Coskun (2016)
- Tan and Law (2012)