The Global Economy in the Next Generation: The Growth Report at 15

Michael Spence
Asian Monetary Policy Forum
May 2023
The Growth Report
Strategies for Sustained Growth and Inclusive Development
Members of the Commission on Growth and Development

Montserrat Abadellali, Deputy Chairman, Planning Commission, Government of India,
New Delhi

Edmar Barba, Director, Casa Das Garças Institute for Economic Policy Studies, and Senior
Advisor, Banco Itaú BBA, Brazil; former Senior Advisor to the Minister of Finance in the
implementation of the “Plano Real,” and former President of the National Development
Bank (BNDES)

Dr. Boediono, Governor, Bank Indonesia; former Coordinating Minister for Economic Affairs,
Professor of Economics, Gadjah Mada University, Indonesia

Lord John Browne, Managing Director, Riverstone Europe LLP; former CEO of British
Petroleum p.l.c., United Kingdom

Kemal Derviş, Administrator, the United Nations Development Programme; former Minister
for Economic Affairs and the Treasury, Turkey

Alejandro Foxley, Minister of Foreign Affairs, former Minister of Finance, Chile

Goh Chok Tong, Senior Minister in Cabinet and Chairman, Monetary Authority of Singapore;
former Prime Minister, Singapore

Han Duck soo, Former Prime Minister, Former Deputy Prime Minister, and Former Minister
of Finance and Economy, the Republic of Korea

Dawidul Hifner, Commissioner for Regional Policy, European Commission; former
United Nations Under Secretary General and Executive Secretary of the UN Economic
Commission for Europe; former roles in the Polish government: Polish Minister for
European Affairs, Minister for European Integration and Deputy Minister for Foreign
Affairs, Minister Head of the Chancellery of the President of the Republic of Poland;
Deputy Minister for Trade and Industry

Carin Janzén, Former Minister for International Development Cooperation, Sweden

Pedro Pablo Kuczynski, Former Prime Minister and former Minister of Economy and Finance,
Perú

Danny Liepertz, Vice President for Poverty Reduction and Economic Management, the World
Bank Group Commission Vice Chair

Trevor Manuel, Minister of Finance, South Africa

Mahmoud Mohieeldin, Minister of Investment, Arab Republic of Egypt

Ngozi N. Okonjo-Iweala, Managing Director, the World Bank Group; former Minister of
Finance and Foreign Affairs, Nigeria

Robert Rubin, Chairman of the Executive Committee, Citigroup Inc.; Former Secretary of the
Treasury, United States

Robert Solow, Nobel Laureate in Economics; Institute Professor Emeritus, Massachusetts
Institute of Technology, United States

Michael Spence, Nobel Laureate in Economics; Professor Emeritus, Stanford University;
Commissioner Chair, United States

Sir K. Dwight Venner, Governor, Eastern Caribbean Central Bank, St. Kitts and Nevis

Ernesto Zedillo, Former President of Mexico; Director, Yale Center for the Study of
Globalization, United States

Zhou Xiaochuan, Governor, People’s Bank of China
Perspectives on Growth: A Political-Economy Framework
Lessons from the Singapore Experience

Tan Yin Ying
Alvin Eng
Edward Robinson

MAS Staff Paper No. 47
Abstract

With the evolution of neoclassical growth models, it became increasingly evident that factor accumulation alone was insufficient for sustained growth. Empirically, the growth experience of many countries and the numerous extensive cross-country regressions provided evidence that good policies and sound institutions were important factors in explaining divergent economic outcomes. These factors were playing a significant role in building and sustaining the momentum for growth.

This paper attempts to develop a framework that matches a country’s growth performance to a set of qualitative variables, with particular emphasis on political-economy variables covering institutions and geography. We find that rich natural endowments do not guarantee prosperity; rather, indicators measuring institutional and leadership quality matter to growth performance. Political ideologies and systems notwithstanding, strong institutions and capable leaders are relevant in (a) formulating good, pro-growth policies, (b) implementing these policies, and (c) building social consensus, which allows a country’s population to be aligned with pro-growth policies. Taken together, these factors shed some insights into the art of policy making for pro-growth outcomes. The paper also illustrates the relevance of these factors in Singapore’s own growth development experience over the past 40 years.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economy</th>
<th>Period of high growth**</th>
<th>Per capita income at the beginning and 2005***</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Botswana</td>
<td>1960–2005</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brazil</td>
<td>1950–1980</td>
<td>960</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>1961–2005</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hong Kong, China*</td>
<td>1960–1997</td>
<td>3,100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td>1966–1997</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japan*</td>
<td>1950–1983</td>
<td>3,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Korea, Rep. of*</td>
<td>1960–2001</td>
<td>1,100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malaysia</td>
<td>1967–1997</td>
<td>790</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malta*</td>
<td>1963–1994</td>
<td>1,100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oman</td>
<td>1960–1999</td>
<td>950</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Singapore*</td>
<td>1967–2002</td>
<td>2,200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taiwan, China*</td>
<td>1965–2002</td>
<td>1,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>1960–1997</td>
<td>330</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

** Source: World Bank, World Development Indicators.
Figure 2 The Common Characteristics of High, Sustained Growth

- Openness
  - Import knowledge
  - Exploit global demand

- Leadership and governance
  - Credible commitment to growth
  - Credible commitment to inclusion
  - Capable administration

- Macroeconomic stability
  - Modest inflation
  - Sustainable public finances

- Market allocation
  - Prices guide resources
  - Resources follow prices

- Future orientation
  - High investment
  - High saving
Reflections: we knew it would become dated and indeed it has

- Low to middle income transition
- The Shift of the COG of the global economy to the east and to Asia
- Climate change – we knew it was coming – now it is here
  - Awareness dramatically higher now
- Fragmentation and partial dismantling of the Post WW II system
- The digital transformation and biomedical and life sciences revolution
- Global explosion of science and tech related entrepreneurial activity
- The end of a multi-decade period of deflationary forces and demand constrained growth to supply constrained growth

Danny Quah
Evolution of Income Inequality: Top 10% to Bottom 50%

**Figure 2.4** Global income inequality: Between-country vs Within-country inequality (ratio T10/B50), 1820-2020

**Interpretation:** Between-country inequality, as measured by the ratio T10/B50 between the average incomes of the top 10% and the bottom 50% (assuming everybody within a country has the same income), rose between 1820 and 1980 and has since strongly declined. Within-country inequality, as measured also by the ratio T10/B50 between the average incomes of the top 10% and the bottom 50% (assuming all countries have the same average income), rose slightly between 1820 and 1910, declined between 1910 and 1930, and rose since 1980. Income is measured per capita after pensions and unemployment insurance transfers and before income and wealth taxes. **Sources and series:** wiid2022.wid.world/methodology and Chancel and Piketty (2021).
Sustainability Challenge

Annual CO₂ emissions by world region

This measures fossil fuel and industry emissions. Land use change is not included.

Source: Our World in Data based on the Global Carbon Project (2022)

1. Fossil emissions: Fossil emissions measure the quantity of carbon dioxide (CO₂) emitted from the burning of fossil fuels, and directly from industrial processes such as cement and steel production. Fossil CO₂ includes emissions from coal, oil, gas, flaring, cement, steel, and other industrial processes. Fossil emissions do not include land use change, deforestation, soils, or vegetation.
## Top Emitters

### Top Emitters (*Billions of tons of CO2 per Year*)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>TOTAL*</th>
<th>PER CAPITA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>10.20</td>
<td>7.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USA</td>
<td>5.30</td>
<td>15.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU</td>
<td>5.40</td>
<td>9.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canada/Mexico</td>
<td>1.20</td>
<td>10.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>2.60</td>
<td>1.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>1.10</td>
<td>5.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>World</td>
<td>36.60</td>
<td>4.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Percentage of top 6</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Peaks and Growth in CO2 Emissions

GHG emissions in 2020 and trend since 1990, including inventory-based LULUCF (GtCO$_2$e)

- China
- USA
- India
- EU27
- Indonesia
- Russian Federation
- Brazil
- International transport

Legend:
- LULUCF CO$_2$
- Fossil CO$_2$, CH$_4$, N$_2$O, F-gases
The Transitory Mistake

- Supply chain imbalances and bottlenecks
- Pandemic closures
- China Zero-Covid

![Global container freight rate index from January 2019 to November 2022](image-url)

*Source: Statista 2022*
Transitory Supply Constraints

Global container freight rate index from January 2019 to November 2022

(in U.S. dollars)

Supplementary notes
The source tracks the freight costs of 40ft containers via eight major routes, including spot rates and short-term contract rates. The values are an average of the five business days.
Secular Supply Conditions

- After 40 plus years of essentially demand constrained growth
- Shift to a supply constrained growth
- Lewis turning point in the global economy
- Aging
- Shocks and Diversification
- Public Debt – in an inflationary rising interest rate period
- Declining productivity trends
- Major sectors resistant to digitally enabled productivity growth
- Geo-political tensions and fragmentation
- Permanent increase in real interest rate
- Asset price reset
- Major shifts in labor market conditions
  - Labor shortages
  - Industrial concentration and questions about competition
Long Period of Deflation

Selected US Consumer Goods and Services, and Wages

Overall inflation (+55.6%)

Source: BLS

Over all 2.2%
Structure of Advanced Economy
Supply Constraints and Productivity

- For nontradable, labor productivity per worker went from 92,201 in 1998 to 104,034 in 2019 while labor productivity grew from 99,976 in 1998 to 183,601 in 2019 for tradables, That's a 0.57% and 2.94% average annual growth rate for nontradables and tradables, respectively.
The Non-Tradable Sector

• 80% of employment
• Low productivity growth
• Rising real relative costs
• Big employment sectors: government, education, health, traditional retail, hospitality
  • 45% to total employment in the US economy – or 56% of nontradable employment
• There is essentially no chance of inclusive growth if these sectors remain productivity backwater
### Aging, Labor Supply, Dependency Ratios and Demand

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>GDP 2021 (BILLIONS $)</th>
<th>POPULATION (MILLIONS)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>WORLD GDP</td>
<td>94.9</td>
<td>8000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AGING COUNTRIES/REGIONS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EUROPE</td>
<td>23.5</td>
<td>746</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USA</td>
<td>22.9</td>
<td>332</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHINA</td>
<td>16.9</td>
<td>1300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JAPAN</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CANADA</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AUSTRALIA</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEW ZEALAND</td>
<td>0.25</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RUSSIA</td>
<td>1.65</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL - AGING COUNTRIES</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>2715</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% OF THE GLOBAL ECONOMY</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AGING - BY GDP AND POPULATION</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Sovereign Debt From GFC Through the Pandemic
Major Transformations
Solar Costs

Residential PV
(22 Panel System)

Commercial
Rooftop PV (200 kW)

Utility-Scale PV,
Fixed Tilt (100 MW)

Utility-Scale PV,
One-Axis Tracker (100 MW)

- Soft Costs—Others (PIR, Land Acquisition, Transmission Line, Sales Tax, Overhead and Profit)
- Soft Costs—Install Labor
- Hardware BOS—Structural and Electrical Components
- Inverter
- Module
- Additional Costs from Model Updates
An artificial intelligence (AI) network developed by Google AI offshoot DeepMind has made a gargantuan leap in solving one of biology’s grandest challenges – determining a protein’s 3D shape from its amino-acid sequence.
Image Recognition

Object Detection, LSVRC Competition

Accuracy

Year

Source: image-net.org
DNA Sequencing

Cost per Human Genome

Moore's Law

NIH
National Human Genome Research Institute

genome.gov/sequencingcosts


$100,000,000
$10,000,000
$1,000,000
$100,000
$10,000
$1,000
$100
How DNA defects can be edited out

The Crispr-Cas9 technique can fight sickness at its source

1. Scientists identify a **defective DNA strand** to be cut out and modified.

2. They create **guide RNA** that has the same genomic sequence as the defective DNA. This is combined in a cell with a protein called **Cas9** that acts like scissors to cut the defective DNA.

3. The **guide RNA** finds the matching genomic sequence.

4. Cells are able to detect and repair broken DNA. A **healthy strand of DNA** is inserted at the cut site and enzymes repair it.

Then the **Cas9** cuts the strand making a break in the DNA helix.

Cell repair systems can use a piece of complimentary DNA, called a template. Scientists can add beneficial changes to the template, such as correcting a disease-causing mutation.

Source: FT research © FT
Globalization of Tech Entrepreneurial Activity
Semiconductor Evolution

TSMC Device Scaling (MTr/mm²)

- 2014: 16nm
- 2015: 7nm
- 2016: 5nm
- 2017: 3nm
- 2018: 2.5nm
- 2019: 2nm
- 2020: 1.5nm
- 2021: 1nm
- 2022: 0.5nm

Source: WikiChip Analysis
Digital Transformation

• eCommerce
• Mobile Payments and fintech
• Data as the new collateral
• Secure Digital identity
• Healthcare and inclusive growth patterns
• Ambient Intelligence
How will Singapore evolve in the next decade?

Predicting the future evolution of a city like Singapore over the next decade is inherently speculative. However, based on current trends and initiatives, here are some potential areas of development and changes that may occur in Singapore:

1. **Sustainable and Smart City**: Singapore has been actively working towards becoming a sustainable and smart city. Over the next decade, we can expect further advancements in areas such as green infrastructure, renewable energy adoption, waste management, and efficient urban planning. The city-state will likely continue investing in technology and data-driven solutions to enhance livability, efficiency, and environmental sustainability.

2. **Digital Transformation**: Singapore has been at the forefront of digital transformation efforts, and this trend is expected to continue. The city will likely see increased integration of technology into various sectors, including finance, healthcare, logistics, and transportation. Initiatives such as the Smart Nation vision will further drive innovation and digitalization across different aspects of daily life.

3. **Innovation and Start-up Ecosystem**: Singapore has cultivated a vibrant start-up ecosystem in recent years, and this trend is likely to continue. The government will likely provide further support through funding, infrastructure, and regulatory frameworks to encourage entrepreneurship and attract global talent. Singapore's focus on research and development, coupled with its strong intellectual property protection, will likely foster
4. Aging Population: Like many developed countries, Singapore is experiencing an aging population. To address this demographic shift, there will likely be a greater emphasis on healthcare, elderly care services, and infrastructure that caters to the needs of older adults. Technology-enabled solutions, such as telemedicine and remote monitoring, may play a significant role in delivering healthcare services to the elderly.

5. Connectivity and Transportation: Singapore already has a highly efficient transportation system, but there may be further developments in the next decade. This could include expansion of public transportation networks, the adoption of autonomous vehicles, and increased connectivity between different modes of transport. Efforts to reduce congestion and promote sustainable mobility options are expected to continue.

6. International Collaboration: Singapore has a reputation for being an international hub for business, finance, and trade. In the next decade, the city-state is likely to strengthen its ties with other countries and forge new partnerships. This could involve deeper economic integration, trade agreements, and collaborations in sectors such as technology, research, and innovation.

It's important to note that these predictions are speculative and subject to various factors and uncertainties. Singapore's future evolution will depend on the choices made by its government, the global economic landscape, technological advancements, and other social and geopolitical factors.
Generative AI

- Only the first chapter
- Impact: knowledge economy
  - In terms of jobs and work, think of it as the WFH universe
- A very large productivity surge
  - Some of it (maybe a lot of it) unmeasured
- If the only impact were software/coding, the impact would already be large
- Data and computing power -
- Brynjolfsson et al:
  - Breaking the limited domain constraint
  - Powerful digital assistants
  - Generative AI operating on text, speech, images, video, at the same time, that is in an integrated way – may lead to breakthroughs in robotics
- But that is some distance in the future
Two Stories about Bard:

Inflation

Bengali
Thank you
Slides: in case there are questions about aspects of growth in the coming decade.
Short Term Implications

- Declining global growth
- WB cut forecast for 2023 from 3% (June) to 1.7% (Jan 2023)
- Within shooting distance of a global recession
- Central banks will eliminate the demand/supply imbalance
  - By reducing aggregate demand
  - Harder than it might seem because of “healthy” balance sheets
  - With little help from the supply side
Longer Term

• A kind of stagnation or a surge in productivity and other measures of welfare (not captured in conventional national income accounting)
Clinicians Workflow

• Clinicians spend up to 35% of their time on medical documentation tasks, taking valuable time away from patients.
• Currently, physicians perform documentation during or after each patient visit.
• Some providers use medical scribes to alleviate this burden, resulting in 0.17 more patients seen per hour and 0.21 more relative value units per patient
• Ambient microphones (with AI) could perform a similar task to that of medical scribes.
• In one study, researchers trained a deep-learning model on 14,000 h of outpatient audio from 90,000 conversations between patients and physicians.

• The model demonstrated a word-level transcription accuracy of 80%, suggesting it may be better than the 76% accuracy of medical scribes.

• In terms of clinical utility, one medical provider found that microphones attached to eyeglasses reduced time spent on documentation from 2 h to 15 min and doubled the time spent with patients.
Hurdles To Overcome

• Security of data
• Standards, rules and laws around the management of data
• Privacy is crucial
• “Ownership” is more complicated – and not really the solution
• Data is useful when it is pooled and shared
• Infrastructure (and cost)
• The Jio revolution and digital India
• AI and computing power – for the training of algorithms
Structured and unstructured environments

- This is a big technical challenge
- AI’s perform best (now) in structured environments (factory flow, fulfillment center, highways with clear lane markings)
- Kaifu Lee and the gardener.
- We need breakthroughs in AI and Robotics along with VR and AR in order to automate not just routine jobs, but low paying, dangerous, or boring jobs.
- The promise is higher productivity, improved income equity, and often higher quality of delivered services.
What about jobs?

• Less of a concern in a labor shortage environment
• Incentives for labor saving higher in this new environment
• Skills different and the transitions not easy
• Automation and augmentation
  • In the end, automation and mechanization are just augmentation
  • Sure, there is “replacement” in specific tasks
• In my view, to pursue both growth and better distributional outcomes, it is crucial to focus on productivity in the the low productivity (low paying) sectors. And on expanding the reach of digital technologies to these sectors.
Low Income Countries

• Stabilize the finances and fiscal positions
• External financing and risk reduction for investment
  • Climate adaptation and mitigation
  • Digital infrastructure:
    • And they have to get the service provisions and pricing right.
• The Asian growth model may still work for awhile
• But digital will displace labor intensive manufacturing, removing abundant labor as a source of comparative advantage
• The new growth models: have to engage with the rapidly growing trade in services sectors.